

## IMPACT OF INCENTIVE POLICY AND FACILITATION OF INVESTMENT IN TOMOHON CITY AREA

*Ginna Ivana Oktova Kaparang*  
*Administrasi Publik Departement*  
*ginnaivana@gmail.com*

*Jeane ELangkai*  
*Administrasi Publik Departement*  
*jeanelangkai@unima.ac.id*

*Sisca Beatrix Kairupan*  
*Administrasi Publik Departement*  
*siscakairupan@unima.ac.id*

---

### Abstract

This study aims to analyze the impact of Incentives and Facilitating Investment Policies in Tomohon City, using a phenomenological qualitative research approach with observational data collection techniques, interviews and documents. The results of this study indicate that the policy of providing incentives and facilitating investment in the Tomohon City area: a) has not had a positive impact on the target group, b). negative impact on groups outside the target. For that it is suggested that: a). to equalize perceptions for related parties regarding the goals and objectives of policies and models for inputting funding sources, b). The position of the Perwako is the legal basis for policy implementation and is scrutinized carefully in order to avoid fraud

**Keywords:** Policy Impact of Providing Incentives and Ease of Regional Investment, Tomohon City.

---

### Introduction

In 2019 Indonesia was shocked by the Covid-19 virus which had an impact on community business activities in North Sulawesi, more specifically in the City of Tomohon. Tomohon City has an area of 147.21 square kilometers and is located at an altitude of 757-806 above sea level, with an average temperature of 18-30 degrees Celsius. Tomohon City has a strategic position for the interests of transportation, economy and tourism. The city of Tomohon has the opportunity to do business in the industrial sector of stilt houses, handicraft/bamboo industry, home industry/snacks and food management.

The city of Tomohon has been affected by the Covid-19 pandemic where there has been an increase in the number of poor people and a decrease in the graph of the number of trading facilities (Tomohon in figures, 2022) and there are micro and small businesses such as; cafes, street vendors, basic food stalls, restaurants, tourist attractions whose income has decreased and some have even closed their businesses.

This condition urges the government of Tomohon City to establish an Incentive and Ease of Investment Policy with the aim that micro-entrepreneurs can continue to develop their businesses and maintain the existence of these businesses. Incentive policies for micro, small and medium enterprises are channeled to business actors who need business capital, including incentives Agriculture Sector namely Horticulture, ornamental plant business. The agricultural sector contributed 14.01 percent to the 2019 Broto

Regional Domestic Product figure with a growth rate of 5.32 percent.

The tourism sector also has quite promising opportunities, because as one of the producers of tourism economic growth, it can also be a driver of growth in other development sectors. The city of Tomohon has a rapidly growing tourism potential marked by the emergence of new tourist destinations such as tourist objects, both natural, man-made and historical, arts and culture as well as community hospitality, becoming potentials that have selling points and attract domestic and foreign tourists. foreign countries as well as the cool air and beautiful natural nuances make tourists feel comfortable traveling in Tomohon City.

Improving governance through the issuance of incentive policies and facilitating investment is intended to create a conducive business climate that can optimize economic growth in real terms.

The improvement made by the Tomohon City Government to support the investment climate is by enacting a policy of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment, which is stipulated through the Regional Regulation of the City of Tomohon Number 8 of 2018 which is supplemented by implementing regulations, namely the Regulation of the Mayor of Tomohon Number 59 of 2019 concerning Standard Operational Implementation Procedures Providing incentives and/or providing facilities to the public and/or investors. These regulations are based on Government Regulation Number 24 of 2019 concerning Providing Incentives and Facilitating Investment in the Regions and Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 64 of 2012 concerning Guidelines for Implementation of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment in the Regions.

Incentive Policy for Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment, which is complemented by the Mayor of Tomohon Regulation Number 59 of 2019 concerning Standard Operational Procedures for Implementing Incentives and/or Providing Facility to the Community and/or Investment. application to the One Stop City Investment Service of Tomohon. Furthermore, a Team for Verification and Evaluation of Investment Incentives and/or Facilitation Activities was established, chaired by the Regional Secretary of Tomohon City, with the task of verifying files and eligibility for business actors to receive incentives. Incentive recipients who pass the verification are decided through a Decree of the Mayor of Tomohon.

Regional Government Information System Policy, in article 6 of Permendagri Number 70 of 2019 confirms that Regional Government Information Systems: a). built and developed to produce regional government information services that are interconnected and integrated on an electronic basis, b). can be accessed through the official website of the Ministry of Home Affairs.

The Regional Government Information System states that Regional Development Information contains: a) regional development planning data; b) Regional Development Analysis and Profile; and c) regional development planning information. Regional Development Information is managed by the Regional Development Research and Development Agency as part of the regional development implementation process. Details of various government activities have been entered in advance in an integrated system.

Special implementation in Tomohon City when the policy of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment is implemented, incentive recipients submit an application in advance to the Tomohon City One-Stop Integrated Service Investment Agency.

In fact, the policy of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment cannot be implemented, because there are no items regarding providing investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022. The closest item in the Regional Government Information System that relates to this policy is in the form of Money Grant Expenditure to Non-Profit, Voluntary, and Social Agencies and Institutions That Have Registered Certificates. While these items are not in accordance with the ultimate goal of providing investment incentives, namely to generate additional Regional Original Income.

Based on the data above, a study was carried out from the dimensions of public policy, especially the impact of the implementation of the Incentives and Facilitation of Investment policy in Tomohon City.

### **Research Methods**

This study uses qualitative research with the aim of analyzing the impact of the implementation of Incentives and Facilitating Investment policies in Tomohon City.

Data collection techniques were carried out through observation, documents, and structured interviews using purposive sampling, and the collected data were analyzed through modified Milles and Hyberman model analysis techniques.

### **Results and Discussion**

The public interest in the perspective of service providers and the perspective of citizenship according to Donald Kettl discussed by Nugroho, (2011: 141) explains that public administration is faced with three issues, namely: shrinking government and strengthening of the private sector; the biggest source of deficit in each country is due to the process of organizing public administration, and the entrepreneurial government icon. This theoretical study shows that the government as a state administrator, especially in Tomohon City, needs to introspect into the public organizations it leads, that is a challenge where the public tends to trust less in government administrators who show less seriousness in making and formulating a policy for the public interest.

Keban (2008: 5-6) cites the views of Chandler and Plano seeing public administration as a managerial process in terms of organizing and coordinating available resources through the process of formulating, implementing and managing decisions in the form of public policies. Meanwhile Curdy sees public administration as a political process in carrying out various functions of the State. Meanwhile Starling sees public administration in the form of achieving government promises during campaigns, and in contrast to Henry sees public administration as a combination of theory and practice to promote government to the public and encourage government administration to be more responsive to public needs.

Syafiee, (2006: 25) cites the view of George J. Gordon who says that public administration is formulated as a process carried out by public organizations with other public organizations, related to the application of regulations issued by the legislature. Public administration takes care of the public interest and in this service various government bureaucracies apply various disciplines to their duties and functions, so that the public is positioned as a collaboration between government administrators and the public who are placed based on their respective positions and work assignments. The concepts mentioned above indicate that government administrators must have a serious commitment in implementing their respective functions as both legislative and executive institutions. Where there is a fact that in Tomohon City there is poor communication between the legislature and the executive body, especially in an effort to implement the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 64 of 2012 concerning Guidelines for Implementation of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment in the Regions, which is followed up with a Policy for Providing Incentives and Ease of Investment, through the Tomohon City Regional Regulation Number 8 of 2018 and the Tomohon City government complementing it with the Tomohon Mayor Regulation Number 59 of 2019 concerning Standard Operational Procedures for Implementing Incentives and/or Providing Facility to the Community and/or Investors.

The Government of Tomohon City in carrying out public interests within the framework of public administration requires a policy by Bacon and Lasswell cited by Parson, (2005: 16-17), that policy is rational ingenuity, meaning that policy makers must be shrewd in responding to higher policies that become a derivative of a lower policy where the Tomohon City government has shown the most important choices made to assist business actors in overcoming increasing poverty as a result of Covid-19. This means that the Tomohon City government should carry out a careful formulation analysis by using logic about what is determined and how to do it and what are the possible obstacles and what the impact will be. The policy of providing incentives and facilitating investment is a smart choice of the many problems and the Tomohon

City government has succeeded in setting a priority scale on which ones take precedence because they are very urgent, and which ones need to be postponed. However, it is very unfortunate that the policy of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment cannot be implemented, because there is no item regarding providing investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022. The objective of increasing Regional Original Income cannot be implemented because the income from providing investment incentives cannot be carried out because profit in nature as opposed to items that must be included in the Regional Government Information System.

### **1. Impact policy of Providing Incentives and Ease of Investment on the Target Situation**

Thomas Dye in his study of public policy writes that everything that is implemented by government administrators and why they choose to implement it is included in the concept of public policy. This view emphasizes rational reasons for carrying out and not carrying out problem solving because it relates to the priority scale and limited funding resources. Dye, (1976: 1), agrees with Heidenheimer who defines public policy as a collection of public problems that are identified, arranged, scheduled and formulated in the agenda of government administrators. Dye considers that public policy is what government administrators want to do, which is accompanied by reasons for consideration why government administrators determine these actions, and consider the impact of the policy. Friedrich and Anderson define public policy as a set of concrete actions taken by government administrators to achieve goals and objectives to address a public problem. How public problems are formulated and prioritized by policy makers, this is related to the ability of available funds and resources. Information from the Regional Government Information System operator AK said that the input of beneficiary data or incentives for increasing business capital was not realized because there were no items regarding providing investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022 while the addition of Regional Original Income had not Friedrich and Anderson define public policy as a set of concrete actions taken by government administrators to achieve goals and objectives to address a public problem. How public problems are formulated and prioritized by policy makers, this is related to the ability of available funds and resources. Information from the Regional Government Information System operator AK said that the input of beneficiary data or incentives for increasing business capital was not realized because there were no items regarding providing investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022 while the addition of Regional Original Income had not Friedrich and Anderson define public policy as a set of concrete actions taken by government administrators to achieve goals and objectives to address a public problem. How public problems are formulated and prioritized by policy makers, this is related to the ability of available funds and resources. Information from the Regional Government Information System operator AK said that the input of beneficiary data or incentives for increasing business capital was not realized because there were no items regarding providing investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022 while the addition of Regional Original Income had not can be implemented because the income from providing investment incentives cannot be implemented because it is profit in nature which contradicts the items that must be included in the Regional Government Information System.

Public policies that are being implemented are certain to have positive and negative impacts on policy objectives. These impacts can be in the form of objects in the sense of increasing the income of business actors which are called outputs, while policy outcomes are in the form of how the policy is implemented and what the implementation of the policy is.

The impact of public policy can be evaluated on targets, namely business actors who submit requests for incentives for venture capital assistance whether the agricultural industry, the tourist destination industry, restaurants and the handicraft industry and others.

The city of Tomohon, with a strategic position for transportation to Minahasa and Southeast Minagasa Regencies, South Minahasa, has business opportunities in the industrial sector: stilt houses,

handicrafts/bamboo, housing/snacks and food management. The city of Tomohon has been affected by the Covid-19 pandemic with an increase in the number of poor people and a decrease in the graph of the number of trading facilities (Tomohon in figures, 2022) and there are micro and small businesses, namely cafes, street vendors, basic food stalls, restaurants, tourist attractions where their income has decreased to even close business.

Anderson 1984 measures the impact of output policies in terms of achieving certain standards while measuring outcomes looks at the changes that occur from the implementation of political policies. Based on interviews, the Head of the Head Office of the Investment Service One Stop Service for Tomohon City, based on interviews, confirmed that the Standard Operating Procedures for Implementation of Incentives and/or Provision of Conveniences to Communities and/or Investors has not had a good impact measured in terms of output and outcome because business actors submit requests for capital assistance incentives business whether the agricultural industry, tourist destination industry, restaurant and handicraft industry and others who apply for business assistance, have not received incentives because there are no items regarding providing investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022.

This information was also confirmed by the financial analysis and the head of the GK division.

Business actors who submitted requests for assistance, namely EP and, JP also acknowledged that because this policy had not been realized because business actors had not received business capital assistance, especially for handicraft/bamboo business actors, snack food sellers and food managers and ornamental plant farmers

**The success of policy implementation is determined by the implementation of policies whose goals and dictums have been well researched before being enacted as public policies. Before it is implemented, it must be analyzed logically whether there is a mistake in the determination related to a higher level policy or is already appropriate. Policies that have an impact when examined from a results perspective, a policy is said to be successful if the policy has an impact on the target group, namely micro, small and medium enterprises.**

The impact of the policy proposed by Dye (1981) is measured by the overall effect caused by public policy in real life conditions. A number of policy impacts that need to be considered in policy evaluation, namely: The impact of the policy on the situation of the target group both on current and future conditions, direct costs of policies, in the form of sources of funds and funds used in policies and indirect costs of policies. It is difficult to measure the indirect benefits of policies on the community, and there are six ways to evaluate the target situation, other affected groups, current and future conditions, funds used, indirect costs and indirect benefits.

## **2. Impactpolicy of Providing Incentives and Ease of Investmenton Group Situations Outside the Target**

Impact is a change in social economic conditions as a result of policy output. The impact of public policy can occur in terms of adding to public problems or groups outside the target. The impact of policies on non-target groups is often referred to as externalities or spillover impacts in the present and in the future

Dating, on direct and indirect costs incurred. (William N. Dunn, 1994). For this reason, the formulation and determination of public policy requires accuracy.

There are a number of problems in policy evaluation regarding the positive and negative impacts of policy implementation. The goals to be achieved are the impact on groups outside the target. Impact is often measured both quantitatively and qualitatively. Overall resulting from the implementation of policies recognized or not have an impact on the real life of groups outside the target or target. Anderson (1984), writes that all forms of policy benefits and costs, whether direct, indirect or future, must be measured in terms of symbolic or tangible effects. Policy outputs are various things that are done by the government that are measured by certain standards. The apparent value of the quantity provides little information about the

outcome or impact of public policy.

Improving the economic life of the people of Tomohon City who depend on micro, small and medium enterprises is being sought by the Tomohon City Government by supporting the investment climate. Policy on Providing Incentives and Facilitation for Investment and Standard Operational Procedures for Implementation of Providing Incentives and Providing Facilities for the Investor Community. This policy is based on the Policy for Providing Incentives and Facilitating Investment in the Regions as well as Guidelines for Implementation of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment in the Regions.

In 2019 the City of Tomohon was affected economically and socially due to co-19. The volume of world trade has the potential to be lower than previously estimated due to disruptions to global supply chains. Global commodity prices continued to rise, including energy, food and metal commodities, putting pressure on global inflation. Rising global inflation accelerated the normalization of monetary policy in developed countries, which resulted in increased uncertainty on global financial markets. This has resulted in limited foreign capital flows and depressing exchange rates in various developing countries, including Indonesia and the City of Tomohon.

The indicator is that one of the biggest contributors to improving the economy of North Sulawesi is in the world of investment, which ranks second as a contributor to GRDP, namely an average of above 35%. Accordingly, private investment also declined. In Q1 2022 North Sulawesi Domestic Investment contracted by 71.16% (yoy) continuing the downward trend in the previous two quarters which contracted by 25.84% (yoy) and 45.27% (yoy) respectively. Likewise, FDI performance in North Sulawesi, which contracted in Q1 2022 by 98.33% (yoy), continued in Q4 2021 to contract by 43.01% (yoy).

North Sulawesi, which has historically always grown above the national level, has experienced growth below national performance since Q3 2021. This is mainly due to the fact that naturally North Sulawesi does not have commodities that are currently in demand by the global market such as coal, copper, CPO, etc. From the expenditure side, although almost all aspects of North Sulawesi's expenditure are better than the national one, on the investment side which holds the second largest portion (35% on average after consumption), North Sulawesi has experienced a decline since Q3 2021 and last recorded a contraction of -1.08 %.

The decline in investment in North Sulawesi occurred in three aspects, namely:

1. PMDN, which contracted by 71.16% (yoy) in Q1 2022, continued the downward trend in the previous two quarters, which contracted by 25.84% (yoy) and 45.27% (yoy), respectively.
2. FDI in North Sulawesi also contracted in Q1 2022 by 98.33% (yoy) continuing the previous quarter's contraction of 43.01% (yoy).
3. Government capital expenditure (APBD and APBN) which until Q1 2022 has only reached 10.56% (yoy);

One of the areas with great investment potential in North Sulawesi is Tomohon City. The city of Tomohon has an area of 147.21 square kilometers and is located at an altitude of 757-806 above sea level making Tomohon have an average temperature of 18-30 degrees Celsius. in 2021 there will be 100,853 people with a workforce of 50,248.

The city of Tomohon is an area flanked by mountains, namely Mount Lokon, Mount Tatawiran, Mount Mahawu and Mount Tampusu. To grow and develop into a city that equates the concept of prosperity with the progress of modernization, but religious.

With a distance of approximately 24 km from the provincial capital and being a transportation route for the surrounding area, placing Tomohon City in a strategic position for transportation, economic and tourism purposes, the Tomohon City Government continues to boost economic growth and business opportunities for people in the industrial sector to absorb labor such as; The stilt house industry which is

known by the world and adds to regional income, the handicraft/bamboo industry still survives today, the home industry/snacks and the food processing industry.

The city of Tomohon has not escaped the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic so that there has been an increase in the number of poor people and a decrease in the graph of the number of trading facilities (Tomohon in figures, 2022). There are many micro and small businesses such as; cafes, street vendors, basic food stalls, restaurants, tourist attractions where since the Covid-19 pandemic the income from these businesses has begun to decline and some have even closed their businesses, because the impact of the pandemic itself has been felt especially for micro businesses .

The Government of Tomohon City establishes an Incentive and Ease of Investment policy with the aim that micro-entrepreneurs may develop their businesses and maintain the existence of these businesses. Incentive policies for micro, small and medium businesses are channeled to micro, small and medium business actors who need business capital, in the form of incentivesThe Agricultural Sector, namely Horticulturehas an important and strategic role in development in Tomohon City and is one of the drivers and supports of the community's economy.

The agricultural sector has proven to be the most able to survive during the Covid-19 pandemic, because agricultural products are the basic needs of society.

The agricultural sector contributed 14.01 percent to the 2019 Broto Regional Domestic Product (PDRB) figure with a growth rate of 5.32 percent. The development of ornamental plant production in Tomohon City has also increased.

The tourism sector has promising opportunities, because apart from being one of the producers of tourism economic growth, the tourism sector is also expected to be a driver of growth in other development sectors. The position of Tomohon City has a rapidly growing tourism potential marked by the emergence of new tourist destinations such as tourist objects, both natural, man-made and historical, arts and culture as well as the hospitality of the people of Tomohon City which has a potential that has selling points and attracts tourists which is blessed with cool air and beautiful natural nuances will make tourists comfortable traveling in Tomohon City.

With the existence of tourism potential which is supported by an annual event on an international scale, TIFF and part of the North Sulawesi Golden Triangle Scheme opens investment opportunities such as:

1. Tourism Information Technology Development
2. Construction of a tourism school
3. Tourism object business/tourism area (nature tourism, cultural tourism, special interest tourism)
4. Accommodation Service Business (hospitality, villas, homestays, apartments, cottages, bungalows),
5. Travel Service Business (travel agency, Tour Operator)
6. Business transportation / tourism transportation
7. Development of integrated entertainment areas with supporting facilities and infrastructure.

Improvement of governance is needed to form a conducive business climate that can optimize economic growth in real terms, related to the performance of the Regional Government in providing policies, facilities and supporting tools to improve the business climate.

One of the efforts to improve Governance carried out by the Tomohon City Government to support the investment climate in Tomohon City is the existence of a policy of Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment, which is stipulated through Regional Regulation (Perda) of Tomohon City Number 8 of 2018 which is complemented by implementing regulations, namely Regulations Mayor of Tomohon (Perwako) Number 59 of 2019 concerning Standard Operating Procedures for Implementing Incentives and/or Providing Facility to Communities and/or Investors. These regulations are based on Government Regulation

Number 24 of 2019 concerning Providing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment in the Regions and Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 64 of 2012 concerning Guidelines for Implementing Incentives and Facilitation of Investment in the Regions.

However, it must be admitted that the special incentive policy in Tomohon City, when the Incentive Provision and Investment Facilitation policy was implemented, had not had a positive impact on the community outside the target or targets, instead it had a negative impact on the Tomohon community.

In fact, the policy of providing incentives and facilitating investment cannot be implemented, even though several business actors have passed the verification period and have been determined as recipients of business capital assistance incentives. The absence of an item regarding the provision of investment incentives in the Regional Government Information System in 2022 and the absence of the closest item in the Regional Government Information System have an impact on the implementation of this policy. It has not even had an impact on increasing regional original income from the micro, small and medium business actor sector.

Dye, 1981 and Anderson, 1984), wrote a number of policy impacts that need to be considered in policy evaluation, namely: The impact of the policy on the target situation or group. For example, micro, small and medium enterprises in the agricultural, horticultural and snack sectors or low-income communities.

### **Conclusion**

The impact of the policy on other situations or groups other than the target situation or group or externality or spillover effects, because the sum of a number of public policy outcomes is very meaningful to be understood in terms of externalities, such as civil servants and drivers of goods and services. The impact of policies on current conditions and conditions future. direct cost of policy, in the form of sources of funds and funds used in this policy program, it is certain that costs are quite high because this policy is based on the Regional Regulations of the City of Tomohon and is followed up with the Regulations of the Mayor of Tomohon. Policy indirect costs, which include the loss of opportunities to carry out other activities from micro, small and medium enterprises because they had hoped to receive business capital incentives from the Tomohon City government. These costs are often not taken into account in evaluating public policies because some cannot be quantified. Because of this, according to Dye (1981), it is important not to measure benefits solely in the form of government activities. This needs to be looked at because what is often seen is the measurement of government activities merely measuring policy output. In explaining the determinants of public policy, the size of public policy output is very important to note. However, in assessing the impact of public policy, it is necessary to find the identity of changes in the environment related to efforts to measure government activity. With the non-implementation of incentive policies for small and medium enterprises in Tomohon City, this policy has a negative impact on groups that are not the target of the policy.

### **Suggestion**

a. The results of this study indicate that this policy: a) Has not had a positive impact on the target group, b). negative impact on groups outside the target. For that it is suggested that: a). to equalize perceptions for related parties regarding the goals and objectives of policies and models for inputting funding sources, b). The position of Perwako is the legal basis for policy implementation and is examined carefully to avoid mistakes.



**Reference**

1. Augustine Leo. 2006. Fundamentals of Public Policy, Bandung Alfabeta.
2. Akib, Haedar. 2009. Articulation of the Development of Public Administration Science, Read Journal Edition: Vol. 2 No. 3, Research Center for Research Institute at Pepabri University, Makassar.
3. \_\_\_\_\_. 2009. Snapshot of the Impact of Public Policy in Poverty Alleviation Programs. Entrepreneur NO. 05 TH XXXVIII.
4. \_\_\_\_\_. 2010, Policy Implementation: What, Why, and How, Journal of Public Administration, Volume 1 No. 1, UNEM Research Institute Research Center.
5. Anderson James E. 2000. Public Policy Making. Boston Houghton Mifflin.
6. Keban Yaremis T. 2005. Local Government Performance Indicators: Management Approach and Policy. Yogyakarta: (Paper).
7. \_\_\_\_\_. 2008 Public Administration, Gava Media Publisher.
8. Dunn William N. 2013. Introduction to Public Policy Analysis. Yogyakarta: elephantMad University Press.
9. Edwards III. George C. 1980, Implementing Public Policy. Congressional Quarterly Press. Washington DC
10. Grindle, Marilee. S. 1980. Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
11. James P. and Joseph Stewart. 2000. Public Policy: an Evolutionary *approach*.(Australia: Wadsworth, Sediton).
12. Mazmanian Daniel and Paul A. Sabatier (eds). 1981. Effective Policy *Implementation*. Lexington Mass DX: Health.
13. Nugroho Riant. 2006. Public Policy: For Developing Countries. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo Gramedia Group.
14. \_\_\_\_\_. 2011. Public Policy. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo Gramedia Group.
15. Miles Matthew B A. Michael Huberman. 2007. Qualitative Data Analysis Tjetjep Rohendi Rohidi's translation. Jakarta: UI-Press.
16. Syafiee, Inu Kencana. 2006. Public Administration Science. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
17. Subarsono. 2005. Public Policy Analysis: Concepts, Theories and Applications. Y Jogjakarta: Student Libraries.
18. Van Meter, Donal and Van Horn, Carl E. 1975. The Policy Implementation Process Conceptual Frame Work. Journal Administration and Society.
19. Wahab Solichin Abdul. 2010. Policy Analysis: From Formulation to Implementation of State Policy. Jakarta: Earth Script.
20. Widodo, Joko. 2007. Public Policy Analysis. Malang: Bayu Media Publishing.